



FOR THE STUDY AND PROTECTION OF SCOTTISH ARCHITECTURE

AHSS East Lothian Cases Panel,
15 Rutland Square, Edinburgh, EH1 2BE, Scotland.
www.ahss.org.uk tel. 0131 557 0019

Service Manager - Planning
East Lothian Council

16 June 2017
Your Refs: 17 /00408/LBC
& 17/00407/P

John Muir House

My Ref: 17.13 [EH41 4PY]

Haddington EH41 3HA

Please quote my reference number above, in all correspondence about this letter.

Dear Sir

Thank you for giving the Society the opportunity to comment on the following planning applications.

17/00408/LBC and 17/00407/P 2 Sunnyside Cottages, Traprain EH41 4PY

This OBJECTION refers to both applications

PROPOSAL: alterations, extensions, new dormers and garage.

The Society objects most strongly to the proposed works to this single early 19th century house in a unified terrace of contemporary farm workers' houses, which would not only harm the special interest of the individual house, but also damage the designed unity of the whole row of Listed buildings, of special architectural or historic interest. The magnificent Listed Sunnyside Steading, stands on the east side of the road, further down the hill, and this single, long row of its farm cottages facing north, is built along the contour, extending at right-angles from the west side of the road, and its rear elevation can be viewed from that road, when approaching uphill, and the front elevations from higher up the road.

The proposed alterations to 2 Sunnyside Cottages, are contrary to Council Policy ENV3(1), which provides that "The external or internal alteration of a Listed Building will only be permitted where it does not harm the architectural or historic character of the building." The Society further invites the Council to consider if the proposed garage conforms with subparagraph 3 of this Policy (see below).

2 Sunnyside Cottages is part of a listed terrace of traditional farm cottages. The listing reflects the distinguished design of the terrace as a whole. All its elevations are protected, not just the main one. The proposed removal of the chimney at Number 2 would prejudice the architectural ensemble. The chimneys along the ridge of Sunnyside Cottages are a carefully designed, unifying feature. They all are still in place and, although in various states of repair, all are original. If Number 2's chimney is in a poor state it should be repaired. The repairs to the chimney stack of Number 1 do not provide a precedent for complete demolition. It has been repaired, not destroyed. This chimney is in any case not part of the run of chimneys along the roof ridge.

The proposed addition of a timber porch and the erection of dormers on the building, would alter the character of that elevation of the Listed building. It would also set a precedent which, if followed, would be likely to create even worse damage. The use of timber in the front elevation at Number 1 does not provide a precedent. It is unassertive and screened by a stone wall.

If the roof space of Number 2 is to be converted, it should be done within the existing envelope, as in other examples already granted permission. Any new roof-windows should preferably be confined to only one elevation.

The proposed garage is unnecessary, as cars are now designed to stand outside. Several of the cottages have modest garages or other garden buildings, near the end of the long gardens, many are poorly designed and incorporate non-traditional materials. The Society invites the Council to review the extent to which the siting, scale and materials proposed for this new garage at Number 2, go beyond these precedents. The test should be Council Policy ENV3(3), which provides that “New development that harms the setting of a Listed Building will not be permitted.”

The Society urges the Council to refuse the present harmful applications, damaging both to the house and the whole designed and Listed terrace, and to their settings, and to negotiate a more sensitive scheme of alteration which would preserve the character and special interest of this Heritage Asset.

Yours sincerely

Bill Dodd

On behalf of East Lothian Cases Panel of A H S S

Cc Historic Environment Scotland

**The Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland (AHSS) is a registered charity: SC007554 REG
The Society is registered as a Company Limited by Guarantee: SC356726**