



Speaking for Scotland's Buildings

20 May 2021

City Development Department
Dundee City Council
Dundee House
50 North Lindsay Street
Dundee
DD1 1LS

Dear Sir or Madam

Dundee 21/00286/LBC Proposed Demolition of Craigiebank Church and Church Halls to create a cleared site for potential re-development

After having examined the application as detailed above, the local AHSS Cases Panel wishes to object to the proposal to demolish and clear the site at Craigiebank Parish Church and Hall.

This Category-B listed building was designed by Frank Thomson in 1937, who was the son of Dundee's city architect and engineer, James Thomson. The church and associated halls sit in the centre of a concentric layout within the planned residential neighborhood of Craigie Garden Suburb. Designed in 1919 by James and Harry Thomson, its layout was inspired by Ebenezer Howard's Garden Suburb. Its setting is, therefore, particularly sensitive, despite not being designated as a conservation area.

The documents, which have been submitted to support the application for the demolition of the Church and Halls do not sufficiently demonstrate that there is a bona fide case for demolition, particularly for that of the Hall. This is contrary to Policy 49 of the Local Development Plan, Historic Environment's Policy Statement (2011) and 'the 1997 Act' which states that applications for demolition of listed buildings should be refused unless their loss has been fully considered and justified. There is no evidence that: the site has been marketed for sale for a reasonable length of time to secure their continuing/alternative use; and that all reasonable efforts have been made to retain the listed building, whilst it has not been adequately demonstrated that it is beyond meaningful repair.

The Panel is particularly concerned that the Hall is included within this application and does not appear to feature in the condition assessment- indeed, its condition in photo 16 appears to be very good. This building has been managed by the Craigiebank Association (Scotland) Ltd, who maintain the hall building, use it for worship and community use and state that they wish to continue using it. The Halls form part of the listing and there is no justification to the amendment of the previously approved scheme of 2011 where partial demolition was approved along with retention of the Hall.

Yours sincerely,

Sarah Kettles

Cases Panel Secretary