



Speaking for Scotland's Buildings

This comment was submitted by the AHSS Forth & Borders Cases Panel via an online planning portal

Council: City of Edinburgh

Application reference: 21/2710/FUL

Address: 35 East Barnton Avenue, Edinburgh

Date AHSS comment submitted: 18th June 2021

The AHSS Forth & Borders Cases Panel has examined this application, and object to the proposed removal of the original porch to the main north gable.

35 East Barnton Avenue is a bold Arts and Crafts mansion by Dick Peddie & McKay, which makes a strong contribution to its local conservation area. The main façade is to the south, and makes use of prominent gables with rustic wood detailing to a projecting balcony.

This is echoed to the north where the service quarters have a separate entrance under a substantial but relatively plain gable, with a rustic wood rear porch. Both the gable elevation and porch are readily visible from East Barnton Avenue - more so than the front elevation - and will remain so above the proposed hedge, with the porch's gable and upper part of its structure visible from the road.

Rusticated woodwork, although very popular around the time of this house, has a very poor survival rate due to decay, changes in fashion, and its more complex construction. The north porch is therefore an important survival, and an essential part of setting the architectural language of the house as seen from the street.

The north porch should be retained in its present form to maintain the character of both the house and wider conservation area, and the proposed canopy which requires its replacement should be largely omitted or re-thought. The horizontality of the proposed porch as it wraps around the north gable elevation conflicts with the traditional vocabulary of that elevation. This compromises it in a way that the remainder of the proposed east extension does not compromise the east elevation.