

## Speaking for Scotland's Buildings



*This comment was submitted by the AHSS Highlands & Islands Cases Panel via an online planning portal*

**Council:** Comhairle nan Eilean Siar

**Application reference:** 20/00376/PPD

**Address:** Angmar Cottage, Malaclate, Sollas, Isle Of North Uist

**Date AHSS comment submitted:** 7<sup>th</sup> October 2020

The AHSS Forth & Borders Cases Panel has examined this application, and objects to these proposals as they stand.

The existing ruins, although delisted, form part of the historic curtilage of A-listed Struan Cottage as shown on maps (e.g. 1903 OS 25" sheet Hebrides XXX.15), and are only ten metres away from it. Therefore any alterations to their form will significantly affect the immediate setting of an A-listed building, and must be considered in this context.

The historic outline and design of Angmar Cottage should form the basis of any new development on the site.

An extension to the rear as proposed will not impact greatly upon Struan Cottage, but the materials used throughout must be of appropriate quality and local style. This would include a thatched roof, and wood-framed windows, of traditional style and size on the front elevation, but potentially modern in style to the rear.

We object to this application because it:

- 1) is on a different site footprint, closer to Struan Cottage. The historic site of Angmar Cottage offers adequate room for a similar development.
- 2) is angled differently from Angmar Cottage, so that the rear extension is more visible from Struan Cottage. Again the historic site and orientation would be preferable.
- 3) has its windows set too widely compared to Angmar and Struan Cottages, and historic precedents. They should be significantly nearer the front door.
- 4) makes inappropriate use of modern materials. uPVC and EPDM are not suitable in this location due to the close proximity of the A-listed building. Wooden framed traditional windows and doors should be used, with a thatched roof to the main cottage. The use of high quality modern materials on the rear extension is appropriate, including the proposed metal sheeting, and alternative glazing such as wood or aluminium frames.

As presented, this is not sufficiently sympathetic to Struan Cottage in design, materials and location.